# Revisiting the Waves of Controversy: A Critical Examination of the USS Liberty Incident Through Documentary Film and Literature

Douglas C. Youvan

doug@youvan.com

April 9, 2024

In the shadow of the Six-Day War's tumultuous events, the USS Liberty incident remains one of the most controversial and debated episodes in military history. "Revisiting the Waves of Controversy: A Critical Examination of the USS Liberty Incident Through Documentary Film and Literature" embarks on an in-depth exploration of this incident through the lens of two pivotal documentaries and three seminal books. This paper critically evaluates the narratives, evidentiary support, and perspectives offered by these works, each contributing uniquely to the discourse surrounding the USS Liberty. From firsthand accounts of survivors to the meticulous analysis of declassified documents, this examination seeks to untangle the complex web of history, politics, and memory that surrounds the event. By engaging with diverse narratives, the study underscores the importance of multi-faceted perspectives in understanding historical controversies. This paper aims not only to shed light on the nuances of the USS Liberty incident but also to contribute to the broader dialogue on how history is interpreted, remembered, and retold.

Keywords: USS Liberty incident, Six-Day War, documentary film, historical literature, declassified documents, military history, political controversy, intelligence operations, survivor accounts, historical analysis.

*Note: Verbatim GPT-4 with its last update on April 2023.*

## Introduction

On June 8, 1967, amidst the tumultuous backdrop of the Six-Day War—a conflict that dramatically reshaped the Middle East—the USS Liberty, a United States Navy technical research ship, found itself embroiled in a devastating and mysterious attack. Struck by Israeli forces in international waters off the Sinai Peninsula, the incident resulted in the tragic loss of 34 American servicemen, with more than 170 wounded. The attack on the USS Liberty has since evolved into a focal point of intense debate, speculation, and a myriad of unanswered questions that persist to this day.

The known facts of the incident are thus: The USS Liberty was performing signal intelligence collection operations in a volatile war zone. Israeli aircraft and torpedo boats launched a surprise assault on the vessel, which lasted approximately 75 minutes. The aftermath revealed significant damage to the ship and a high casualty rate among its crew. Israel subsequently apologized for the attack, attributing it to mistaken identity, believing the ship to be an enemy vessel. Compensation was offered to the victims' families and for the ship's damages, but this did little to quell the controversy.

At the heart of the ensuing debate are questions regarding the intentions behind the attack and the adequacy of subsequent investigations. Was the assault a tragic error as officially stated, or was there a more sinister motive? The incident's complexity is deepened by geopolitical considerations, including U.S.-Israeli relations and the broader Cold War context, making it fertile ground for researchers, historians, and conspiracy theorists alike.

This paper sets out to critically examine two documentaries—"The Day Israel Attacked America" produced by Al Jazeera and "Dead in the Water" by the BBC—alongside three seminal books: "Assault on the Liberty" by James M. Ennes Jr., a survivor of the attack; "Attack on the Liberty" by James Scott, which provides a comprehensive historical account; and "Body of Secrets" by James Bamford, which places the incident within the broader

narrative of NSA operations. Each of these works contributes uniquely to the public discourse, offering varying perspectives that range from personal narratives to investigative journalism. Through a critical lens, this examination aims to dissect the narratives constructed by these documentaries and books, assessing their methodologies, biases, and the quality of evidence presented. This analysis not only seeks to understand the incident more deeply but also to reflect on how historical narratives are shaped and reshaped over time, influenced by new evidence, changing political landscapes, and the persistent quest for truth.

As we navigate through the intricate layers of the USS Liberty incident, this paper will endeavor to provide a balanced overview of the event's complexities and the multifaceted discussions it continues to inspire. The goal is not merely to revisit a historical event but to engage with the ongoing dialogue that surrounds it, recognizing the importance of critical inquiry in the pursuit of understanding.

## "The Day Israel Attacked America" - A Film by Al Jazeera

Al Jazeera's documentary, "The Day Israel Attacked America," stands as a pivotal contribution to the discourse surrounding the USS Liberty incident. Through its investigative approach, the film endeavors to unravel the complexities of an event that has been mired in controversy and speculation for decades. This section examines the documentary's methodology, its use of primary sources, and the broader implications of its findings, while also considering potential biases inherent in its narrative construction.

*Investigative Approach*

The documentary distinguishes itself through a rigorous investigative framework, employing a combination of survivor interviews, declassified

documents, and archival footage. This multipronged approach allows the film to reconstruct the incident with a level of detail that highlights discrepancies in the official narratives provided by both the U.S. and Israeli governments. By focusing on primary sources and firsthand accounts, "The Day Israel Attacked America" provides a vivid recounting of the events, lending credence to its conclusions while inviting viewers to reconsider established understandings of the incident.

*Survivor Interviews*

One of the documentary's most compelling aspects is its extensive use of survivor interviews. These personal testimonies not only humanize the tragedy but also offer insights that challenge the official account of mistaken identity. Survivors recount harrowing tales of the attack, describing moments of confusion, bravery, and loss with poignant clarity. These firsthand narratives are instrumental in constructing a counter-narrative that questions whether the attack could have been a deliberate act. The emotional weight of these testimonies adds a powerful dimension to the documentary, fostering a deeper empathy and engagement with the audience.

*Archival Footage and Declassified Documents*

The inclusion of archival footage and declassified documents serves to bolster the documentary's historical authenticity. This evidence provides viewers with a direct window into the past, allowing for independent interpretations of the events. By making such materials accessible, the documentary enhances its investigative rigor, offering a tangible foundation upon which its conclusions are built. However, the interpretation of these documents and the selection of footage can also introduce biases, framing the narrative in a light that supports the documentary's thesis.

*Implications of Conclusions*

The documentary's conclusions are profound, suggesting that the attack was not a case of mistaken identity but a deliberate act. This assertion has significant implications, challenging not only historical accounts but also the diplomatic narratives that have shaped Israeli-American relations since the incident. By positing a deliberate attack, the documentary raises uncomfortable questions about accountability, the fog of war, and the lengths to which states may go to protect strategic interests.

*Potential Biases*

While "The Day Israel Attacked America" is lauded for its investigative depth, it is not immune to criticisms of bias. Detractors argue that the documentary may present a one-sided view, selectively using evidence that supports its narrative while downplaying or ignoring counter-evidence. The political context in which Al Jazeera operates may also color perceptions of the documentary's objectivity. Such criticisms are important to consider, as they remind viewers of the need to approach historical documentaries with a critical eye, recognizing that every narrative construction, no matter how well-researched, carries with it inherent biases.

In conclusion, "The Day Israel Attacked America" makes a significant contribution to the ongoing dialogue surrounding the USS Liberty incident. Its strengths lie in its detailed investigative approach, the poignant use of survivor interviews, and the critical examination of archival evidence. However, the documentary's potential biases and the controversial nature of its conclusions invite viewers to engage with the material critically, appreciating the complexities of historical narrative construction. Through this critical lens, the documentary serves not only as a source of information but also as a catalyst for further inquiry and debate.

## "Dead in the Water" - A BBC Documentary

The BBC documentary "Dead in the Water" occupies a crucial space in the discourse surrounding the USS Liberty incident, providing a nuanced exploration of one of the most controversial episodes in US-Israeli relations. This critical examination focuses on the documentary's evidentiary basis, its interview selections, the narrative it constructs, and its broader impact on public understanding and historical discourse.

*Presentation of Evidence*

"Dead in the Water" leverages a robust collection of evidence, including declassified documents, eyewitness accounts, and expert testimonies, to construct its narrative. The documentary's strength lies in its ability to contextualize the USS Liberty incident within the larger geopolitical framework of the 1967 Six-Day War, drawing on a wide range of sources to offer a comprehensive view. The documentary meticulously examines the sequence of events leading up to, during, and after the attack, presenting a compelling argument that challenges the official narrative of mistaken identity. This thorough evidentiary approach enriches the documentary's narrative, offering viewers a detailed examination of the incident's complexities.

*Interviews*

A notable aspect of "Dead in the Water" is its extensive use of interviews with survivors, military personnel, and government officials. These interviews provide a multifaceted perspective on the incident, combining personal accounts of the attack's horror with expert analyses of its possible motivations and implications. The inclusion of voices from both American and Israeli perspectives attempts to provide a balanced view, though the selection of interviewees and the emphasis on certain testimonies over others can influence the documentary's overall stance. The power of these

personal narratives lies in their ability to humanize the abstract political and military analyses, bringing the impact of the incident to life for viewers.

*Narrative Framework*

The documentary's narrative framework skillfully weaves together the historical context, eyewitness accounts, and investigative findings into a coherent story that challenges viewers to reconsider established narratives. By positioning the USS Liberty incident as a possible deliberate act rather than a tragic mistake, "Dead in the Water" invites controversy and debate. This framing is effective in engaging viewers but also raises questions about narrative bias and the documentary's interpretative stance. The narrative's construction, focusing on the possibility of a deliberate attack, serves as a provocative counterpoint to official explanations, encouraging a reevaluation of historical and political understandings of the event.

*Influence on Public Understanding*

"Dead in the Water" has had a significant impact on public understanding of the USS Liberty incident. By bringing attention to discrepancies in the official account and highlighting the survivors' stories, the documentary has contributed to a broader questioning of the incident's accepted history. Its presentation of detailed evidence and alternative analyses has fueled ongoing debates about the incident's nature and motivations. However, the documentary's influence also extends to its capacity to generate discussion about the complexities of wartime decision-making, the fog of war, and the challenges of historical interpretation.

*Approach to Controversial Claims*

The documentary's handling of controversial claims is characterized by a careful balance between presenting evidence and acknowledging the complexities inherent in historical analysis. While it advocates for a particular perspective on the incident, "Dead in the Water" also underscores the limitations of available evidence and the difficulties in drawing definitive conclusions. This approach highlights the documentary's role not just as a

purveyor of a specific viewpoint but as a contributor to a larger, ongoing conversation about truth, memory, and history.

In conclusion, "Dead in the Water" stands out for its comprehensive examination of the USS Liberty incident, its effective use of personal testimonies and declassified evidence, and its challenge to the official narrative. While the documentary inevitably navigates the waters of controversy, its significant contribution lies in its ability to foster a deeper public engagement with a critical historical event, encouraging viewers to question and seek a more nuanced understanding of the past.

## "Assault on the Liberty" by James M. Ennes Jr.

James M. Ennes Jr.'s "Assault on the Liberty" presents a gripping firsthand account of the USS Liberty incident, offering readers an intimate and personal perspective on the events of June 8, 1967. As a survivor of the attack, Ennes brings a unique and deeply personal narrative to the historical record, shedding light on the human aspects of the incident that are often overshadowed by political and military analyses. This section examines the book's narrative approach, its contributions to the historical documentation of the event, and its broader impact on the discourse surrounding the USS Liberty incident.

*Personal and Emotional Narrative*

Ennes's narrative is compelling not just for the factual account it provides but also for the emotional depth it conveys. The book captures the chaos, fear, and camaraderie among the USS Liberty crew during and after the attack. By focusing on individual experiences, including his own, Ennes personalizes a geopolitical event, making the historical moment accessible and relatable to readers. This personal and emotional lens is a powerful tool

in engaging the audience, offering insights into the psychological and emotional toll of the incident on those who lived through it.

*Contribution to Historical Documentation*

"Assault on the Liberty" is a valuable addition to the historical record, providing detailed descriptions of the attack, the crew's response, and the immediate aftermath. Ennes's account is bolstered by meticulous research, including interviews with fellow survivors, reviews of declassified documents, and consultations with military and legal experts. This comprehensive approach ensures that the book is not only a memoir but also a significant historical document that contributes to understanding the USS Liberty incident's complexities.

*Impact on the Conversation*

Since its publication, "Assault on the Liberty" has had a profound impact on the conversation surrounding the USS Liberty incident. The book has been instrumental in bringing attention to the survivors' stories and challenging the official narratives of the event. By providing a platform for a survivor's voice, Ennes's work has fostered a greater public interest in re-examining the incident, prompting discussions on accountability, historical truth, and the importance of memorializing those affected by the attack.

*Strengths in Personalizing the Event*

The book's greatest strength lies in its ability to personalize the USS Liberty incident. Ennes's firsthand perspective offers an authenticity and immediacy that academic analyses and official reports cannot replicate. This personal touch not only enriches the historical narrative but also serves as a poignant reminder of the human cost of geopolitical conflicts. The detailed recounting of personal bravery, loss, and the struggle for recognition adds a vital dimension to understanding the incident's impact.

*Limitations in Scope Due to Subjective Perspective*

While "Assault on the Liberty" offers invaluable insights, its subjective nature introduces potential limitations in scope. The personal perspective, while deeply engaging, may also lead to an emphasis on certain aspects of the event at the expense of others. Additionally, the emotional involvement of the author could influence the presentation of events, potentially leading to biases in how information is interpreted and conveyed. These limitations are inherent in any firsthand account and highlight the importance of considering a range of perspectives when examining historical events.

In conclusion, "Assault on the Liberty" by James M. Ennes Jr. stands as a crucial work in the discourse surrounding the USS Liberty incident. The book's personal narrative, emotional depth, and detailed historical documentation offer a unique and powerful perspective on the events of June 8, 1967. While acknowledging the potential limitations of its subjective viewpoint, the book's contribution to the conversation cannot be overstated, as it continues to provoke thought, challenge established narratives, and keep the memory of the USS Liberty alive.

## "Attack on the Liberty" by James Scott

James Scott's "Attack on the Liberty" represents a pivotal contribution to the historical understanding of the USS Liberty incident. Through exhaustive research, the use of declassified documents, and a series of in-depth interviews, Scott offers a comprehensive account that straddles the line between personal narrative and investigative journalism. This section evaluates the methodology and impact of Scott's work, its role in clarifying the historical record, and the potential biases inherent in such a detailed examination.

*Comprehensive Research and Methodology*

Scott's book is distinguished by its rigorous methodology, combining a thorough review of available evidence with a keen investigative eye. The author's access to and use of declassified documents serve as the backbone of his analysis, allowing Scott to piece together a timeline of events and decisions that were previously shrouded in secrecy or obscured by official narratives. This foundation is enriched by interviews with survivors, officials, and experts, providing a multifaceted view of the incident. Scott's ability to synthesize these diverse sources into a coherent narrative demonstrates a commendable balance of investigative journalism with historical scholarship.

*Balancing Personal Narrative with Investigative Journalism*

"Attack on the Liberty" navigates the delicate balance between personal narrative and investigative rigor with notable skill. Scott leverages personal stories from survivors to humanize the event, adding emotional depth and personal stakes to the historical account. These narratives are not merely anecdotal; they serve as critical evidence that challenges official accounts and invites reevaluation of known facts. Simultaneously, Scott's investigative approach ensures that the book remains anchored in verifiable evidence and broad context, avoiding the pitfalls of speculation and bias that personal accounts might engender. This balance enhances the book's credibility and impact, making it a compelling read for both academic and general audiences.

*Contribution to Historical Clarity*

Through its meticulous research and balanced narrative, "Attack on the Liberty" significantly contributes to clarifying the historical record of the USS Liberty incident. Scott illuminates the complexities and contradictions inherent in the event, providing readers with a deeper understanding of the geopolitical, military, and intelligence dynamics at play. The book's comprehensive analysis challenges simplified or monolithic interpretations

of the incident, promoting a more nuanced view of the events and their aftermath. Scott's work is particularly valuable for shedding light on the interactions between the US and Israeli governments, the intelligence community's role, and the broader implications for international relations.

*Potential Areas of Bias or Speculation*

While "Attack on the Liberty" is widely praised for its thoroughness and balanced approach, any work of this nature is susceptible to potential biases or areas of speculation. Scott's interpretations of evidence, the weight given to certain interviews over others, and the framing of contentious issues may reflect subjective judgment calls. Moreover, the very act of challenging official narratives can be seen as taking a stance, which might influence how evidence is presented or interpreted. However, Scott's transparent methodology and critical engagement with sources largely mitigate these concerns, inviting readers to draw their conclusions based on the presented evidence.

In conclusion, James Scott's "Attack on the Liberty" stands as a critical and comprehensive examination of one of the most contentious incidents in recent history. By expertly balancing personal narratives with investigative journalism, Scott provides a nuanced and deeply researched account that advances our understanding of the USS Liberty incident. While mindful of the potential for bias or speculation, the book's contribution to historical clarity and discourse is undeniable, making it an essential read for those seeking to comprehend the complexities of this tragic event.

## "Body of Secrets" by James Bamford

James Bamford's "Body of Secrets" offers a sweeping examination of the National Security Agency (NSA), within which the USS Liberty incident is situated as a critical moment of Cold War espionage, surveillance, and

national security. Bamford's work goes beyond the immediate circumstances of the attack to place it within the broader context of U.S. intelligence operations and geopolitical strategy. This section critiques Bamford's treatment of the USS Liberty incident, assessing the strengths and weaknesses of his arguments and the book's contribution to the wider discourse.

*Contextualization within Broader Themes*

Bamford's book excels in contextualizing the USS Liberty incident within the larger narrative of American espionage and national security efforts during the Cold War. By doing so, "Body of Secrets" provides readers with a comprehensive understanding of the strategic importance of signals intelligence and the role of the NSA in global affairs. This broader perspective is crucial for comprehending the complexities surrounding the Liberty attack, including why the ship was in the Eastern Mediterranean during the Six-Day War and the potential implications of its intelligence-gathering mission. Bamford's work thus offers a valuable lens through which to view the incident, one that considers the intricate dance of espionage, military strategy, and international diplomacy.

*Strengths of Bamford's Arguments*

One of the key strengths of Bamford's argumentation is his detailed documentation and extensive use of declassified materials. His ability to weave these sources into a compelling narrative sheds new light on the motivations behind the Liberty's mission and the potential reasons for its targeting. Bamford also critically examines the aftermath of the attack, including the political maneuvering and the cover-up efforts that followed, providing insights into the lengths governments might go to protect sensitive operations and relationships. His meticulous research and critical analysis contribute significantly to our understanding of the incident and its place within the broader tapestry of Cold War espionage.

*Weaknesses and Potential Speculation*

While Bamford's work is thorough and informative, it is not without its weaknesses. One potential criticism is the extent to which Bamford speculates on the motivations behind the attack and the implications of the intelligence gathered by the Liberty. Without definitive proof, some of Bamford's conclusions can be seen as conjectural, relying on circumstantial evidence or inference. This approach may leave room for skepticism among readers who prefer concrete evidence over analytical extrapolation. Additionally, Bamford's focus on the NSA and the broader themes of surveillance might detract from the immediate human impact of the Liberty incident, potentially overshadowing the personal stories of those who were directly affected.

*Contribution to Expanding the Discourse*

"Body of Secrets" significantly expands the discourse surrounding the USS Liberty incident by framing it within the larger history of American intelligence and national security. Bamford's examination invites readers to consider the incident not as an isolated event but as a part of the continuous evolution of espionage and surveillance practices. By linking the Liberty to broader themes, Bamford encourages a more nuanced understanding of the incident's significance and its lasting implications for intelligence operations, U.S.-Israeli relations, and the challenges of maintaining secrecy and security in a democratic society.

In conclusion, James Bamford's "Body of Secrets" offers a vital and expansive view of the USS Liberty incident, enriched by its broader examination of the NSA and Cold War espionage. While the book's speculative elements and broad focus may present limitations, its strengths in documentation, contextual analysis, and critical inquiry make it an indispensable resource for understanding the complex interplay of surveillance, national security, and international diplomacy that frames one of the most controversial events in American naval history.

## Conclusion

The critical examination of the two documentaries—"The Day Israel Attacked America" by Al Jazeera and "Dead in the Water" by the BBC—and three seminal books—James M. Ennes Jr.'s "Assault on the Liberty," James Scott's "Attack on the Liberty," and James Bamford's "Body of Secrets"—provides a multifaceted perspective on the USS Liberty incident. This collective exploration underscores the complexity of historical interpretation, the value of diverse narratives, and the ongoing quest for clarity and understanding in the face of controversy.

*Synthesis of Insights*

Each work contributes uniquely to the discourse surrounding the USS Liberty incident. The documentaries offer compelling visual and narrative reconstructions that emphasize the human impact of the tragedy and the contentious nature of the official explanations. In contrast, the books provide depth and context, with firsthand accounts from Ennes, comprehensive historical analysis from Scott, and a broader espionage and national security perspective from Bamford. Together, these works challenge the simplistic narratives and invite a more nuanced understanding of the incident, highlighting the interplay of intelligence operations, military strategy, and international politics.

*Importance of Diverse Narratives*

The examination of these documentaries and books demonstrates the importance of diverse narratives in grappling with historical controversies. Different perspectives not only enrich the discourse but also illuminate the complexities of historical events that are too often obscured by monolithic interpretations. This diversity of narratives encourages critical thinking, empathy, and a deeper engagement with history, allowing for a more informed and nuanced understanding of events like the USS Liberty incident.

*Directions for Future Research and Discourse*

The ongoing discourse surrounding the USS Liberty incident suggests several directions for future research. One area involves the continued exploration of declassified documents and archival materials, which could shed new light on the motivations behind the attack and the subsequent political maneuvering. Another area is the investigation of the personal experiences of those affected by the incident, including both the survivors and the families of those who were lost, which could provide further insights into the incident's human impact.

Additionally, comparative studies of similar incidents in military and intelligence history could offer valuable context, helping to understand the USS Liberty incident within the broader framework of international relations, espionage, and wartime decision-making. Finally, interdisciplinary approaches that incorporate political science, history, psychology, and communication studies could enhance our understanding of how historical narratives are formed, propagated, and challenged.

In conclusion, the critical examination of documentaries and books about the USS Liberty incident reveals the event's enduring complexity and significance. By embracing diverse narratives and pursuing comprehensive research, scholars, educators, and the interested public can continue to uncover the layers of this historical event, fostering a more informed and empathetic discourse. The quest for understanding the USS Liberty incident exemplifies the broader challenges and responsibilities of engaging with historical controversies, highlighting the need for vigilance, openness, and a commitment to uncovering the truth.

## References

### Books:

Bamford, James. *Body of Secrets: Anatomy of the Ultra-Secret National Security Agency*. Doubleday, 2001.

Ennes Jr., James M. *Assault on the Liberty: The True Story of the Israeli Attack on an American Intelligence Ship*. Random House, 1979.

Scott, James. *Attack on the Liberty: The Untold Story of Israel's Deadly 1967 Assault on a U.S. Spy Ship*. Simon & Schuster, 2009.

### Documentaries:

Al Jazeera. *The Day Israel Attacked America*. Directed by Richard Belfield, Al Jazeera English, 2014.

BBC. *Dead in the Water*. Directed by Christopher Mitchell, BBC Four, 2002.